

## TERMS OF REFERENCE (TORs)

### Terms of Reference (TORs) Sindh Early Learning Enhancement through Classroom Transformation Project (SELECT) EGRA ENDLINE STUDY

#### I. Background

The Sindh Early Learning Enhancement through Classroom Transformation (SELECT) Project encompasses a multi-pronged approach towards improving the quality of both teaching and learning practices in primary education, with a particular emphasis on foundational reading in grades 1-5. The Project comprises a series of focused and flexible implementation strategies, targeted at the school and meso- levels (personnel and systems at the school, taluka and district levels). The Project supports improvements in the transition from primary to elementary school, as well as a reduction in dropouts through targeted student attendance redress procedures. The desired Project outcomes would eventually contribute to reductions in learning poverty and in the number of out-of-school children. In order to monitor and measure the progress of the project, improved reading skills in grade 2 will be measured by the Early Grade Reading Assessment (EGRA) in twelve (12) project districts.

Table 1: Project Overview

<b>Project Objectives</b>	The Project Development Objective (PDO) is to improve reading skills of early grade primary students and increase students' retention in primary schools in the project districts.
<b>Project cost</b>	US\$ US\$154.75 US\$ 100 million from IDA and US\$29.9875 million from the Education Sector Program Implementation Grant (ESPIG) of US\$24.775 million from Multiply Grant
<b>Component 1</b>	<b>Transforming teaching practices in the early grades:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Subcomponent 1.1: Implementation of a continuous professional development (CPD) model for improved literacy skills in the early grades.</li><li>• Subcomponent 1.2: Carrying out of behavioral nudges for improved learning.</li><li>• Subcomponent 1.3: Provision of technical assistance for institutional capacity development and support.</li></ul>
<b>Component 2</b>	<b>Developing an effective and safe learning environment</b> – by school upgradation to elementary level and school rehabilitation through refurbishing of the existing classrooms and adding new classrooms to the existing schools, provision of furniture, and adequate WASH facilities by actively pursuing eco-friendly materials and designs.
<b>Component 3</b>	<b>Improving system capacity for better school leadership and management support-</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• <b>Subcomponent 3.1:</b> Establishment of a technology-based student attendance monitoring system.</li><li>• Subcomponent 3.2: Technical assistance and capacity building for school leadership and local education office management to mitigate student dropout.</li></ul>
<b>Component 4</b>	Monitoring and evaluation and project management
<b>Project Districts</b>	Badin, Ghotki, Jacobabad, Kambar Shahdadkot, Kashmore, Mirpurkhas, Matiari, Sanghar, Shikarpur, Sujawal, Tando Muhammad Khan, and Thatta.

## Description of Component 1

The component -1 of the project focuses on transforming teaching practices in the early grades through implementation of the Continuous Professional Development (CPD) model which will be focused on improving the literacy skills in the early grades with specific emphasis on grades 1–5. Main outputs within this component include: (i) implementation of the CPD training for teachers; (ii) capacity development for the teacher training institutes; (iii) implementation of interactive audio and video instruction (IAVI) and teaching and learning materials; (iv) implementation of literacy teaching and learning materials for primary education, including scripted lesson plans, leveled-reading books for students; and (v) implementation of the upgraded comprehensive CPD program and monitoring of student learning outcomes. The results of the subcomponent will be tracked through Performance-Based Conditions (PBCs).

To support improved students' well-being and mitigate future potential risks related to students dropping out, particularly girls, the project will utilize behavioral nudges. These nudges can positively influence how teachers, students, headmasters, and parents interact. The project will pilot a school-based behavioral intervention that will help students recognize that their abilities and skills can change and grow and will focus on key skills such as student efficacy and self-management. The intervention will focus on reading skills to support increased learning outcomes. The content developed under CPD will address gender biases through the intervention training for teachers, learning content for students, and through engagement strategies with parents. This effort is aimed at reducing gender stereotypes that may be biasing the demands for girls' education or their learning capabilities.

Under this Component, technical assistance (TA) and institutional capacity development opportunities are aimed for the SE&LD and its specialized agencies to effectively carry out activities under Component 1. Key TA activities would include (i) review of CPD materials and establishment of grade-level learning targets and performance benchmarks for literacy; (ii) identifying and establishing of partnerships with third-party service providers for teacher training institutes; (iii) creation and delivery of interactive audio and video instruction content and pilot implementation; (iv) training of SE&LD officials on the use of the EGRA and procurement of necessary software and hardware; and (v) support for provincial assessment strategies.

## Project Implementation Arrangements

The SELECT Project will be implemented by SE&LD, Government of Sindh (GoS), through the Project Management and Implementation Unit (PMIU), which will be housed in the RSU. The PMIU will monitor overall implementation of project activities through TA support. The RSU is headed by the CPM (Chief Program Manager), who will be responsible for providing oversight for four tasks: (a) procurement activities under Component 4 and procurement support for other components; (b) financial management and audit for the overall Project; (c) safeguards monitoring and reporting for the entire Project; and (d) Project-specific monitoring and evaluation. Third-party consultants will be hired to support these functions.

The design, implementation planning and coordination for Component 1 will be managed through the Technical Working Groups for each of the project components, with representation from key allied agencies including the Sindh Teacher Education Development Authority (STEDA), Provincial Institute of Teacher Education (PITE) and the Directorate of Curriculum, Assessment & Research (DCAR). Teacher Training Institutes (TTIs) in the selected districts will be responsible for implementing teacher training-related activities. DCAR will be responsible for the implementation of ICT-based formative

assessments and overall development and coordination of learning materials and behavioral activities, and for providing technical support to the component, in coordination with PITE, Directorate of School Education (DSE) and other relevant allied agencies.

## II.Objectives of the Assignment

The PMIU RSU (the ‘Client’), requires the services of a technical firm (the ‘Firm’) to conduct:

1. Measure improvements in foundational reading skills among Grade 2 students following approximately 12 months of literacy interventions delivered through the Continuous Professional Development (CPD) cycle.
2. Assess specific reading competencies—including letter recognition, oral reading fluency, and reading comprehension—using standardized EGRA tools to capture learning gains since the baseline assessment.
3. Evaluate the effectiveness of key intervention components, including professional development provided to Master Trainers, Guide Teachers, Subject Coordinators, and Subject Teachers; provision of learning resources; and implementation of literacy-focused instructional strategies, in contributing to improved reading outcomes.
4. Generate comprehensive findings that offer actionable insights for enhancing existing interventions and designing future literacy programs, with the aim of supporting scalable and sustainable impact across a broader set of schools.
5. Ensure robust data triangulation by cross-referencing student performance data with teacher and head teacher questionnaires, classroom observations, and school-level inputs to validate findings and provide a holistic view of program effectiveness.
6. Review and revise the provincial reading benchmarks/standards by analyzing EGRA baseline 2024 and SRP/PRP data, identifying alignment gaps with foundational literacy priorities, and facilitating technical consultations.

### Research questions for EGRA ENDLINE

The EGRA end-line study aims to answer the following questions for both Sindhi and Urdu languages:

1. To what extent have the reading skills of Grade 2 learners improved compared to the EGRA baseline 2024 assessment in both Sindhi and Urdu?
2. To what extent do Grade 2 learners' reading proficiencies align with the SE&LD reading performance standards after one year of intervention?
3. What progress in reading skills has been observed among students in rural and urban schools compared to the EGRA baseline 2024?
4. What are the differences in reading improvements between girls and boys after the intervention?
5. How have the reading skills of girls and boys in the project districts changed over the intervention period?
6. What are the differences in reading gains among students exposed to different learning interventions, and which intervention was most effective?
7. To what extent the behavioral nudge interventions in teaching practices have improved Grade 2 learners' reading skills?
8. How do school leadership, teacher input, classroom observations, and students' background factors explain differences in Grade 2 reading performance after one year of intervention?

The principal objective of the assessments is not to measure student performance against prescribed curricular requirements, but to evaluate their literacy proficiency at critical educational milestones. Although the assessments will maintain alignment with the national and provincial curriculum, the emphasis is on assessing learners' functional reading abilities in grade 2 and overall literacy development.

### EGRA Baseline Results

The Early Grade Reading Assessment (EGRA) baseline survey was conducted in April 2024, to evaluate the foundational reading skills of Grade 2 learners before the implementation of the intervention. This assessment provided critical insights into students' proficiency levels in core literacy skills, phonemic awareness, oral reading fluency, and reading comprehension. The findings serve as a benchmark for measuring progress and assessing the effectiveness of the intervention in improving early grade reading outcomes.

Sindhi Language Below is a summary of key baseline results, highlighting strengths, gaps, and areas requiring targeted support.

Sindhi Language	EGRA-2024	
	Average	Zero Scores
Oral Reading Fluency Scores (CWPM)	24.79 (CWPM)	45%
Phoneme isolation	5.5 (out of 10)	29%
Non_words (CNWPM)	11.92 (CNWPM)	40%
Listening Comprehension (out of 5 Questions)	1.47	14%
Reading Comprehension	1.47 (out of 5)	40%
Expressive Vocabulary	7.65 (out of 10)	5%

EGRA-Urdu Medium	EGRA 2024	
	Average	Zero Scores
Oral Reading Fluency Scores	19.25	28%
Phoneme isolation	5.27 (out of 10)	27%
Nonwords	13.39 (CWPM)	30%
Listening Comprehension	2.3 (out of 5 questions)	5%
Reading Comprehension	1.19 (out of 5 questions)	60%
Expressive Vocabulary	8.75 (out of 10)	1%

### III.Scope of Services

The detailed scope of services is laid out below:

#### Phase 1: Delivery of Inception Report

The Firm shall submit the inception report for EGRA end-line activity for grade 2 to the Client after two weeks of signing the contract, comprising the following:

##### a) Comparative Situation Analysis

Building on the comprehensive situation analysis established through the baseline survey, the end-line phase will undertake a structured comparative review to assess the impact of the reading intervention. This review will focus on measuring improvements in Grade 2 learners' reading skills across Sindhi and Urdu languages and determine the extent to which students' proficiencies align with SELD's reading performance standards. The analysis will also

examine learning disparities across gender, school location (urban /rural), and target districts, as well as differences in outcomes based on exposure to various intervention models. The study will also assess the fidelity of implementation by evaluating the extent to which planned activities (e.g., teacher training, availability and use of SELECT materials, and instructional strategies) were delivered as intended. The Firm should investigate barriers that may have hindered full implementation, such as logistical challenges, capacity gaps, or local resistance, as well as enablers that supported effective delivery, like strong leadership, community buy-in, or supportive monitoring structures.

In addition, the analysis should identify and document any unintended consequences or external influences that may have impacted learning outcomes during the intervention period. These may include political disruptions, economic constraints, health crises, environmental challenges, or other contextual factors that were either not present or less significant during the baseline phase.

To enrich and validate quantitative findings, the firm will collect insights from a diverse set of stakeholders, including school heads, teachers, district-level officials, and community representatives. These perspectives will help to contextualize observed outcomes and offer explanatory depth regarding the mechanisms driving change—or lack thereof. This holistic analysis will provide a nuanced understanding of the intervention’s effectiveness, capturing both direct impacts and the broader educational ecosystem within which the program operated.

## **b) Research Design and Sampling Plan**

### **Research Design:**

The Firm is required to submit a comprehensive Research Design section as part of the Inception Report. This section must clearly outline the methodological approach to be used for the EGRA End-line Study, ensuring alignment with the objectives and scope of the SELECT Project.

Specifically, the Firm must:

- Describe a mixed-methods research approach, detailing how quantitative data (EGRA tests) and qualitative data (interviews, classroom observations) will be integrated to assess the impact of the intervention on Grade 2 reading skills.
- Present a plan to replicate the baseline sampling methodology, using a cross-sectional design with the same schools and similar sampling parameters, to ensure comparability between EGRA baseline and end-line data.
- Outline the tools and instruments to be used (including digitization via Tangerine® or equivalent), and how they will be adapted and validated for Sindhi and Urdu, in collaboration with relevant provincial institutions.
- Explain how the research will account for key intervention components, including teacher CPD, use of teaching materials, behavioral nudges, and school leadership practices.
- Detail the disaggregation strategy, showing how the analysis will examine variations by gender, district, school type (urban/rural), and type of intervention exposure.

- Describe a triangulation framework for integrating findings from student assessments, teacher and head teacher interviews, classroom observation data, and student background characteristics.
- Highlight how the research design will identify enablers and barriers to effective implementation, and address any external factors that may have influenced learning outcomes (e.g., disruptions, local context).

The research design must provide a solid foundation for rigorous analysis and offer a clear pathway to generating actionable, evidence-based insights for program improvement and policy recommendations.

### **Sampling Plan:**

A representative sample of approximately 7000 students (selected for the baseline survey) will be taken from project schools in SELECT districts, and a subset of schools from a control group, and the end-line survey will be administered randomly to grade 2 students, teachers and head teachers in the classroom and school.

The sample selection for the end-line survey will mirror the methodology used during the baseline to ensure comparability and reliability of results. The study will focus on assessing the same schools included in the baseline assessment, with a new, representative sample of students from the same grade levels along with their current teacher who has received training and part of the SELECT CPD cycle. This cross-sectional approach will allow for a comparative analysis of learning outcomes between baseline and end-line cohorts, thereby providing insights into the overall effectiveness of the intervention. In cases where end-line schools are no longer accessible, similar schools within the same district will be selected to maintain the integrity of the sampling framework. The final sample size will be adequate to ensure statistical power and enable meaningful disaggregation by gender, geographic location (urban/rural), and intervention type. By adhering to a consistent sampling strategy, the end-line survey will enable valid comparisons with baseline data and support robust conclusions about progress in early grade reading skills.

Important considerations for the Firm to bear in mind vis-à-vis sampling are as follows:

- 1) Various interventions under the project (and their interaction)
  - a. rollout of CPD intervention
  - b. rollout of improved learning environment
  - c. rollout of the behavioral nudges' intervention
  - d. rollout of improved school leadership and management practices
- 2) Medium of instruction for school

The sample will be finalized through stakeholders' consultation.

### **c. Ethical Considerations**

The Firm should clearly devise the following aspects that deals with social safeguards of all the stakeholders that will be participating in the EGRA end-line survey such as students, head teachers, teachers, parents and community.

- **Voluntary Participation:** Participation in the assessment must be entirely voluntary for all students, teachers, and school staff. There should be no compulsion or undue pressure to participate.
- **Confidentiality and Data Protection:** Ensure that all personal and assessment data collected are kept confidential. No identifiable information should be disclosed in reports or shared with unauthorized parties.
- **Anonymity in Reporting:** Data should be anonymized during analysis and reporting to protect the identity of participants and institutions.
- **Do No Harm Principle:** Enumerators must prioritize the well-being of the child above all assessments should not cause emotional or psychological distress.
- **Equity and Non-Discrimination:** All children, regardless of gender, disability, socio-economic background, or geographic location, should have an equal opportunity to participate in the assessment.

### (i) Child Safeguarding Measures

- **Training on Child Protection:** All enumerators must be trained on child safeguarding protocols, including recognizing signs of distress, abuse, or neglect, and responding appropriately.
- **Child-Friendly Assessment Techniques:** Enumerators must use age-appropriate, culturally sensitive, and non-threatening approaches to interact with children. Sessions should be conducted in a calm and supportive manner.
- **Safe and Comfortable Environment:** Assessments should be conducted in safe, neutral, and child-appropriate spaces within the school premises, with access to supervision and support if needed.
- **Handling Distress:** If a child becomes visibly distressed or uncomfortable during the assessment, the enumerator must stop the session immediately and notify the school authority as per safeguarding guidelines.
- **Reporting Mechanisms:** The Firm must establish and follow a clear protocol for reporting any safeguarding concerns encountered during data collection to designated authorities or child protection services.

### (ii). Informed Consent Protocols

- Consent should be sought from the child in an age-appropriate manner, ensuring the child understands they can refuse to participate or stop at any time.

#### d) Detailed Work Plan

- The Firm shall prepare and submit a comprehensive work plan, comprising the following:
  - Team composition and logistics
    - ❖ Specify recruitment guidelines including especially those related to child protection requirements, language requirements in proportion to the sampling plan, timeline, training logistics and topics.
    - ❖ Identify the composition of the field survey teams, including the number of Master Trainers/ Quality Control Officers (QCOs), enumerators, and data managers, and their qualifications and trainings with proven track-record.
    - ❖ Specify expected tasks and responsibilities of each member of the team.
    - ❖ Specify travel and logistics arrangements, including for workshops.
    - ❖ Identify equipment that will be procured for fieldwork.

- Field team training plan
  - ❖ Identify timelines for the preparation of the enumerator and QCOs manual.
  - ❖ Identify resource needs for training.
- Survey implementation plan
  - ❖ Pilot and full-scale rollout plan, with list of activities including milestones and timelines:
  - ❖ Guidelines and protocols for data collection, including:
    - Number, approximate length of visits per school, and proposed schedule.
    - Outline of content of monitoring database to monitor the extent to which all schools in the sample have been interviewed
    - Guidelines to ensure the use of a unique identifier in all survey instruments for each unit of observation,
    - Guidelines to collect comprehensive contact information.
  - ❖ Protocols and procedures for engaging with the provincial, district and school level stakeholders such as DEOs, TEOs, and head teachers.
  - ❖ Protocol to ensure that field teams deliver completed instruments and relevant forms to the coordination team before exiting a school. Comprehensive quality control protocols to ensure verifications of all surveys by the supervisor, as well as verification of a sample of surveys by the quality controller. This should include procedures to reconcile inconsistent or missing information, protocols and procedures for addressing data inconsistencies/miss-reporting when identified, protocols for completion of enumeration units and transmission of data from completed questionnaires to the coordination team.
- Data management plan
  - ❖ Progress reporting guidelines
  - ❖ Plans for daily debriefing with data collection team
  - ❖ Management information/reporting tools for tracking progress of survey,
  - ❖ Outline of progress report to be shared with the Client on a weekly basis.
  - ❖ Template for reporting of costs incurred to the Client.
- Data cleaning and analysis plan
  - Specify the use of statistical software (ideally Stata)
  - Guideline for the cleaning of the data and the analysis
  - Guideline for data protection (anonymized data, password protection etc.)

The Inception Report should be presented to the Client for comments and revision, as necessary, prior to commencing field work. The Firm must then implement the data collection plan closely adhering to the plan. As field conditions may dictate changes to these plans, the Firm's Field Supervisors are obliged to inform the Client via the Firm's management, in the form of a written report or progress report every week, if such changes could have an adverse impact on the survey. For urgent situations, the notification should be done as soon as possible but no later than 3 days after the change in conditions was noticed.

**Deliverable (EGRA):** Inception Report, with detailed situation analysis, research design and sampling framework, and work plan for EGRA as defined above

## Phase 2: Development of Instruments

### a) Adaptation of Instruments

- The Firm shall review and adapt the survey instruments for EGRA in Sindhi and Urdu in collaboration and supervision of curriculum and subject experts from PITE, DCAR & TTIs and selected schoolteachers identified by the Client considering the EGRA baseline survey results.
- The Firm shall (i) convene a Two (02) day workshop for EGRA after submission of the Inception Report<sup>1</sup>; followed by a one (01) day workshop for revision and finalization of survey tools (Teacher, head teacher, student questionnaires and classroom observation tool) and (ii) attend the working group or any other EGRA related meetings on request of PMIU to collaboratively plan for review and finalization of instruments/ survey questionnaires.
- It is expected that the instruments will be aligned with the best practices in early literacy assessment internationally and adapted to local conditions, dialect, and cultural context, so as not to introduce any bias into the results due to contextual differences between learners. It is advised to consider the best practices opted during the Sindh Reading Project (SRP) end-line survey and consult with the challenges mentioned in the SRP end-line survey report.
- The following instruments will be used to collect data:
  1. EGRA Student Test
  2. Student Questionnaire
  3. Teacher Questionnaire
  4. Head Teacher Questionnaire
  5. Classroom Observation
- All instruments will be approved by DCAR and the PMIU-SELECT.

**b) Inclusion of Lower Order Skills Subtask**

- Including a letter recognition sub-task in the EGRA end-line is essential for assessing foundational literacy skills, especially in low-resource settings where early-grade learners may struggle with basic letter identification; this allows for a more nuanced understanding of learning gaps, supports alignment with early grade curricula, explains zero scores in advanced tasks, and informs targeted, equitable remedial interventions.

**c) Classroom observation tool:**

- The Firm shall use the same SELECT-TEACH tool, used in the baseline survey to maintain the coherence.

**d) Electronic versioning of Instruments:**

The Firm shall be responsible for digitizing the instruments (EGRA Student Test, Student Questionnaire, Teacher Questionnaire, Head Teacher Questionnaire and Classroom Observation Tool) onto the Tangerine ® Application or similar, to enable remote data collection via Android tablets.

- The Firm shall share the survey program with the Client for testing and obtain approval from the Client before piloting survey instruments and commencing fieldwork.

**e) Development of Survey Manual**

- The Firm shall develop a comprehensive survey manual for MTs/QCO and enumerators, with detailed guidance. The following content to be covered:

---

<sup>1</sup> The Firm shall be responsible for all logistics and travel arrangement of the workshop participation.

- Assessment design and tool development
- Sampling strategies
- Enumerator training and fieldwork procedures
- Roles & Responsibilities
- Data collection & protection protocols
- Safeguarding (i.e., child protection, incident reporting etc.)
- Reporting (data collection, issues & challenges, mitigation etc.)
- The Firm shall share the survey manual with the Client and obtain approval from the Client before piloting survey instruments and commencing fieldwork.
- The Firm shall provide an electronic version of test administrator manual to all data collection teams.
- The Survey Manual will be approved by DCAR and PMIU.

**f) Recruitment of field staff**

- The Firm shall lead the recruitment of technical and administrative staff, field teams (MTs/ QCOs, enumerators) based on the following criteria:
  - Ability to fluently read and speak the languages required for training and EGRA administration.
  - Previous experience administering assessments or serving as a data collector.
  - Experience working with young children.
  - Availability during the data collection phase and ability to work in target areas.
  - Experience and proficiency using a computer or hand-held electronic device (tablet, smartphone)
- The Firm shall verify all selected applicants meet child protection requirements defined by the Client.

It is vital to recruit and train 10% to 20% more enumerators than those set out in the sampling plan to account for attrition. Ensure they receive training and prepared as a backup.

**Phase 3: Training of Field Staff and Pretesting of Survey Questionnaires**

**a) Training of Field Staff**

- The Firm shall lead separate trainings and supervision of qualified MTs/ QCOs, enumerators and data managers (the frequency and schedule of trainings is expected to be proposed by the Firm). The training should:
  - include a simulation visit to schools on a certain day of training, to ensure that every individual data collector can adhere to the required data collection standards
  - include an enumerator evaluation, thereby serving as a screening process for skilled enumerators. This may result in some enumerators being replaced (if their score is too low) or some enumerators being selected for additional retraining (if their score is close to the cut-off for selection).
- Three QCOs and enumerators that do not score at least a 90% agreement rate in their inter-rater reliability (IRR) assessments will not be deployed to the field to collect data.
- The Firm shall support the Client and its team in participating and observing the training as requested.

- The Firm shall budget accordingly for all aspects involved therein. This will include but is not limited to, travel and accommodation, training venues, data collection supplies, printing of learner assessments, charts, posters, subsistence fees and so forth.

**b) End-line Survey Pre-testing**

- The Firm will be working with PMIU, to seek permission from the appropriate SE&LD personnel to schedule and conduct school practice in primary schools.

- After reviewing the non-EGRA tools (head teacher, teacher, student questionnaires and classroom observation tool), a pre testing of the mentioned tools will be conducted to finalize.

**c) Assessment Materials Review Workshop:**

- The selected experts of the assessment material development workshop will be invited to refine tools as per the findings of the pre testing of tools. The logistics and travel arrangements of this workshop will be managed by the survey firm.
- At the end of the review workshop, the Firm should finalize tests for operational assessments

**Deliverable (EGRA):** Supervisor/enumerator/test markers/data enterers training report, final survey questionnaires (Sindhi & Urdu) (in print, tablet), field survey logistic plans. EGRA instruments for monitoring provincial level reading skills.

Phase 4: Data Collection for End-line Survey

**a) Coordination with stakeholders at the field level and verification of schools**

- In close coordination with the Client, the Firm shall seek permission from the appropriate SE&LD officials to schedule and conduct surveys in each of the sampled schools.
- The Firm shall communicate with relevant DEOs/TEOs and head teachers from each of the sample schools to ensure the required sample of Grade 2 learners, and a quiet place has been arranged to conduct the assessment.

**b) Data collection and supervision**

- The Firm shall administer the EGRA in sample schools, along with teacher's classroom observation tool.
- QCO's monitoring of enumerator fieldwork: Field-based quality control from field supervisors shall involve at least 10% direct observation of interviews. The findings from these quality control checks will be shared with the PMIU on a daily basis.
- Office-based physical checks of completed assessments, prior to data cleaning. Team leaders and data checkers shall contact enumerators via mobile phone if there are obvious errors or omissions in completed questionnaires, including:
  - Daily debriefing of the data collection team at the district level shall be arranged by the Firm to review challenges and guide weaker enumerators for better test administrators.

- Office based checks via the data entry programs (illogical data, missing data, duplicate data).
- Office-based checks via statistical methods (demographic profiling, cross-tabulations, individual enumerator and team performance etc.).
- High-frequency checks should be conducted on a daily basis to check for unicity of the IDs, missing data by items and enumerators, length of the questionnaires by enumerators, outlier data, variance of the main items of interest etc.
- All the required tablets will be arranged by the Firm.

**c) Progress reporting**

- The Firm shall submit data weekly after data collection begins (on Friday for data collected that week). Data will be shared on a regular basis.
- The Firm shall provide weekly updates on data collection in a template agreed upon in the Inception Report. The report should include at minimum:
  - Dates of arrival and completion of each school.
  - Any notable difficulties or deviations from the standard field plan.
  - Record of each substitution of schools/students that may have been required. including the reasons for substitution.
  - Any other notable occurrences.
  - Report on real-time validity checks upon receipt of data.

**Deliverable (EGRA):** Field work report, 100% of raw data set.

Phase 5: Final Datasets, Reporting, and Dissemination of Results

**a.) Detailed Analysis of Zero Scorers**

- A detailed analysis of zero scores in the EGRA end-line is vital for identifying the most vulnerable learners and understanding the depth of foundational learning gaps. Zero scores, where a student is unable to answer even a single item correctly in a given sub-task are strong indicators of serious literacy deficits, particularly in early grade contexts.
- Analysis of zero scores will focus on disaggregating data across various dimensions such as gender, geographic location, school type, and socio-economic background. This provides critical insights into which subgroups of students are being left behind and enables targeted interventions to support equity in learning outcomes. For example, a high percentage of zero scores in rural or low-income schools might point to structural disadvantages that require focused remedial efforts or policy-level responses.

**b). Data Triangulation:**

Data triangulation is a critical methodological approach that enhances the credibility, reliability, and depth of findings in the EGRA end-line survey.

To strengthen the validity of findings and support stronger causal inference, the firm must ensure that data from multiple sources namely, classroom observations, student assessments

(EGRA results), and interviews with teachers and head teachers are jointly analyzed in an integrated manner. The final report must not treat these data streams in isolation; rather, it must cross-reference and triangulate them to explain learning patterns more robustly.

For this purpose, the trends observed in EGRA scores should be examined alongside data from head-teacher and teacher interviews and classroom practice indicators gathered through observations. Where student performance is notably high or low, the analysis should explore associated pedagogical practices, school leadership factors, and contextual influences identified through qualitative data.

The Firm is expected to develop and describe a clear triangulation framework in the final report, showing how convergences and divergences across the three data sources were identified and interpreted. This framework should explicitly state the criteria for triangulation (e.g., consistency, complementarity, or contradiction across sources) and explain how triangulated findings contribute to confirming or refining the study's hypotheses regarding intervention effects. Evidence of systematic triangulation should be visible throughout the analytical narrative and not limited to a separate section.

- The Firm is expected to make a link on multiple data sources, such as student assessment results, teacher and head teacher questionnaires, classroom observations, and community-level insights.
- Triangulation allows evaluators to cross-validate findings and build a more comprehensive understanding of the intervention's effectiveness.

### **c). Gender-Disaggregated Data Analysis**

The end-line report must include dedicated sections that analyze all key literacy outcomes disaggregated by gender across EGRA subtasks (e.g., letter name knowledge, letter sound recognition, oral reading fluency, and reading comprehension). The analysis should:

- Compare performance trends between boys and girls in districts, rural-urban and school levels.
- Identify patterns in progress or stagnation since baseline survey.
- Explore potential explanatory factors influencing gender differences, including attendance, classroom participation, socio-cultural norms, teacher attitudes, and access to learning resources.
- Include intersectional insights where applicable (e.g., gender combined with rural/urban location or language of instruction).
- Highlight any unintended consequences of programming on either gender.
- Offer clear, actionable recommendations for addressing observed gender disparities in literacy outcomes, instructional practices, and policy-level interventions.
- Ensure that all charts, graphs, and tables include gender-disaggregated data.

This analysis should not only describe gaps but also examine equity implications, such as how current teaching strategies or school environments may be contributing to or mitigating these disparities.

#### **d). Preparation of Final Datasets**

- The Firm shall prepare and deliver clean and labelled datasets to the Client in Stata format, which include all data collected, daily IRR (Inter-Rater Reliability) reports, supervisor observation checks, supervisor back check interviews, and independent monitoring team back check interviews.
  - Data must contain clearly defined variable and value labels.
  - Raw data and code that can be used to replicate the cleaning will need to be shared with the Client and will be used to produce a codebook based on the instruments.
- The Firm shall resolve any major errors or incomplete data identified by client, if necessary, by returning to the field to replace or complete missing interviews.
- The Firm shall submit a report that describes the overall organization and execution of the survey and data entry, as well as structural organization of the database files. This should include all information related to non-response and replacement procedures for observations that could not be collected as planned.
- The Firm shall organize and archive surveys; ensure archiving is aligned to the Data Documentation Initiative and Dublin Core Metadata standards<sup>2</sup>. Samples to be provided by the Client.

#### **a) Analysis and Reporting**

- The Firm shall organize and lead a debrief meeting with the Client to review lessons learned, challenges and solutions from the end-line data collection.
- The Firm shall develop a comprehensive report of the findings highlighting the findings of all agreed indicators, including one consolidated report and district-specific reports. The results of data disaggregation by gender, grade, language, and other variables of interest must be described as appropriate to the research design.
- The Firm shall develop infographics and PowerPoint presentations for the provincial report as well as district dissemination workshops.

#### **b) Dissemination**

- The Firm shall arrange a provincial workshop to present findings, highlight policy relevance, debate findings and action steps.
- The district level dissemination workshops at each district headquarter will be followed by the provincial dissemination workshop.
- The logistic arrangement for all these workshops will be managed by the Firm.
- Print version of final report to be shared with the participants at district and provincial level.

\*\* All documents and reports must be submitted in two formats: Word and PDF.

#### **Review and Revision of Reading Performance Standards.**

---

<sup>2</sup> The minimal set of Dublin Core metadata elements is a simple set of metadata widely used internationally to describe resources, including data. See <https://dublincore.org/>.

The Sindh province’s Urdu and Sindhi reading performance standards, initially developed with support from the USAID Reading Program, needs to be reviewed and revised to align with recent evidence on student learning outcomes. This process involves analyzing key data sources, including findings from the Pakistan Reading Project’s Early Grade Reading Assessment (EGRA) surveys, baseline EGRA-2024 data gathered through the SELECT project, and trends identified in the Annual Status of Education Report (ASER) over the past five years. By integrating these insights, the aim is to ensure the provincial benchmarks accurately reflect current student performance levels. This data-driven approach will guide adjustments to the standards, enabling educators and policymakers to set realistic, actionable goals for improving reading skills in Urdu and Sindhi, ultimately bridging gaps between expectations and actual classroom results.

**Tasks:**

- Review existing Urdu and Sindhi reading performance standards developed by SE&LD.
- Analyze relevant EGRA reports from the Pakistan & Sindh Reading Projects, SELECT project, and ASER learning assessments.
- Conduct a detailed comparison between performance standards and actual student performance data from the EGRA and ASER findings.
- Identify gaps, misalignments, or overlaps in expected versus observed reading outcomes.
- Engage with key stakeholders (e.g., SE&LD, SELECT, USAID, UNICEF, JICA and local education experts) to validate findings and gather feedback.
- Propose evidence-based adjustments or validation of current performance standards based on analysis outcomes.
- Develop a clear framework for performance standards showing aligned benchmarks across the sources.

**Deliverables:**

1. **Review Report including:**

The selected firm will organize 02 consultative workshops for review and revising the reading performance standards followed by the mentioned below steps.

- Summary of existing reading standards.
- Analysis or review of existing evidence, EGRA baseline 2024, SRP/PRP data of EGRA and ASER data relevant to reading performance and benchmarks.
- Identification of gaps and alignment opportunities.

2. **Revised performance reading standard for Sindhi & Urdu.**

Upon completion of both workshops, the firm shall present the finalized revised reading performance standards, incorporating all endorsed revisions. These standards will be prepared in a professional, publication-ready format for PMIU/SE&LD’s official use.

## iv. Tentative Schedule of Delivery

The entire contract will be for approximately 04 months, beginning with initial kick-off planning meeting after signing of contract with SELECT PMIU that will last through the end of district and provincial level dissemination workshops by April 2026.

	<b>Deliverables</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Proposed Payment</b>
1	<b>Signing contract</b>	As per given time in bidding documents (T)	
2	<b>Inception Report</b> Detailed situation analysis, research design and sampling framework, and work plan for EGRA as defined above	T+(1-2 WEEKS) (X)	10%
3	<b>Training of Field Staff and Pretesting of Survey Questionnaires</b> QCOs/enumerator/test markers/data enterers training report, final survey questionnaires (Sindhi & Urdu) (in print, tablet), field survey logistic plans. EGRA instruments for monitoring provincial level reading skills.	T+(3-4 WEEKS) (X)	10%
4	<b>Field work</b> (with submission of field work report and 100% raw dataset with EGRA and non-EGRA Tools)	T + XX + 5-8 week (XXX)	20%
5	<b>Draft Completion and delivery of data</b> Clean dataset (100% of dataset), draft completion report consist of detail implementation of survey, its finding and recommendations); workshops organized	T+XXX +9-10 week (XXXX)	15 %
6	<b>Final Completion report and data after reviewed by the client</b> Final 100% clean dataset and completion report, approved by the client, with a Sindhi and Urdu end-line language.	T + XXXX + 11-12 weeks (XXXXX)	15%
7	<b>Dissemination Workshops and Submission of workshop reports.</b> 12 districts and one provincial level dissemination workshop report including list of participants.	T + XXX + 13-14 weeks (XXXX)	15%
8	<b>Review and Revising of Reading Performance Standards.</b> Review Report including:		

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Summary of existing reading standards.</li> <li>- Analysis of EGRA and ASER data relevant to reading performance and benchmarks.</li> <li>- Identification of gaps and alignment opportunities.</li> <li>- Use of existing evidence, EGRA baseline, SRP/PRP findings, ASER trends</li> </ul> <p>2. Revised performance reading standard for Sindhi &amp; Urdu.</p> <p>3. Endorsement and approval of revised Reading performance standards from custodian department DCAR.</p>	<p>T + XXXX + 15-16 weeks (XXXXXX)</p>	<p>15%</p>

## v. Qualification and Team Composition

The Firm or institution should possess the following experience and qualifications:

### Organizational Experience and Capacity

- Be legally registered by GoS/Federal government as a company to operate with certificate of incorporation; or, if an institution, be legally registered by the Government and Higher Education.
- The Firm must be an active taxpayer for last 5 years.
- Proven track record (minimum 5 years) conducting large-scale student assessments or related research studies at provincial or national levels.
- Experience implementing projects of similar scale (at least 5,000–10,000 students) in comparable contexts.
- Demonstrated experience in conducting at least two student or educational assessment studies and one policy development project across Pakistan.
- Preference will be given to technical firms that have previously undertaken education sector student assessments, research and evaluation assignments for the World Bank or other international development partners.

### Institutional Capacity

- Availability of qualified core staff (education assessment specialists, EGRA language experts (Sindhi & Urdu) data analysts, MTs/ QCOs etc).
- Established systems for quality assurance, ethical data collection, and data security.

- Logistical capability to conduct fieldwork in all 12 districts (evidence of field presence or networks)
- The Firm must have an established operational office within Sindh Province, with preference given to firms based in Karachi.

### Technical Approach and Methodology

- Understanding of large scale student learning assessments framework, research and ability to contextualize assessment tools to Sindh’s local languages and curriculum.
- Clear sampling design consistent with statistically representative end-line analysis.
- Proposed strategies for instrument adaptation, pretesting, enumerator training, and field monitoring.
- Description of data collection technology through android tablets and data validation protocols.
- Preference will be given to Firms that can demonstrate prior experience in developing educational policy procedures, strategies or benchmarking studies in multilingual education contexts such as review of reading performance standards.

### Data Analysis and Reporting

- Advanced data analysis plan, including psychometric analysis, reliability/validity checks, and subgroup disaggregation (gender, district, socioeconomic status).
- Use of robust software (Stata, R, SPSS, etc.) and capacity for multivariate or hierarchical analysis if required.
- Plans for producing district-wise and aggregate reports with actionable insights.

### Ethical and Quality Assurance

- Clear data quality assurance framework (supervision ratios, back-checks, spot-checks).
- Ethical considerations (informed consent, data privacy, child safeguarding).
- Risk management plan addressing field access, language diversity, and school.
- All data, instruments, code, and documentation are the property of PMIU/SELD. The contractor shall not use, disclose, or distribute any data or materials beyond the scope of the contract without obtaining prior written authorization from PMIU/SELD.

Position	No. of positions	Estimated Expert Person (Months)	Qualifications and Experience
Project Director / Team lead	1	04 Months	<b>Qualification and Knowledge and Experience:</b> At least a Master’s / BS degree (sixteen (16) years of education) in Education, Education Policy or relevant social science, from a foreign or local university duly recognized by the Higher Education Commission (HEC) of Pakistan.

			<p>Minimum 10 years of experience as a survey supervisor and Project Management leader. Minimum 5 years of experience in the field of teacher education, assessment, and training.</p> <p>Knowledge of project indicators, results, and reporting with M&amp;E databases and data management systems. Knowledge and experience in the public education sector in Pakistan is preferable.</p> <p><b>Skills:</b> Excellent skills and experience in documentation/reporting writing manuals, conducting surveys, developing item bank assessments, survey plans development, pedagogy, monitoring, and reporting with a focus on structure, purpose, and audience. Excellent interpersonal and communication skills (oral and written) and professional-level fluency in English and Urdu, Sindhi (an advantage)</p> <p><b>Abilities:</b> Ability to undertake regular field missions, especially in diverse and challenging contexts. Ability to work under pressure and meet deadlines. Willingness to accept the assignment at short notice</p>
<b>Technical Expert EGRA (Sindhi)</b>	1	04 Months	<p><b>Qualification and Knowledge and Experience:</b> At least a Master's /BS degree (sixteen (16) years of education) in Education, Education, Languages or relevant social science, from a foreign or local university duly recognized by the Higher Education Commission (HEC) of Pakistan.</p> <p>Minimum 8 years of experience as a survey supervisor. Minimum 5 years of experience in the field of teacher education, assessment, and training. Minimum 3 years' experience in developing EGRA tools, data collection, data analysis, and reporting related to EGRA survey.</p> <p>Knowledge of project indicators, results, and reporting with M&amp;E databases and data management systems. Knowledge</p>

			<p>and experience in the public education sector in Pakistan is preferable.</p> <p><b>Skills:</b> Excellent skills and experience in writing evidence and research base reports. Excellent interpersonal and communication skills (oral and written). Professional-level fluency in English and Sindhi.</p> <p><b>Abilities:</b> Ability to work under pressure and meet deadlines and willingness to accept the assignment at short notice</p>
<b>Technical Expert EGRA (Urdu)</b>	1	04 Months	<p><b>Qualification and Knowledge and Experience:</b> At least a Master's /BS degree (sixteen (16) years of education) in Education, Education, Languages or relevant social science, from a foreign or local university duly recognized by the Higher Education Commission (HEC) of Pakistan. Minimum 8 years of experience as a survey supervisor. Minimum 5 years of experience in the field of teacher education, assessment, and training. Minimum 3 years' experience in developing EGRA tools, data collection, data analysis, and reporting related to EGRA survey. Knowledge of project indicators, results, and reporting with M&amp;E databases and data management systems. Knowledge and experience in the public education sector in Pakistan is preferable.</p> <p><b>Skills:</b> Excellent skills and experience in writing evidence and research base reports. Excellent interpersonal and communication skills (oral and written). Professional-level fluency in English and Urdu.</p> <p><b>Abilities:</b></p>

			Ability to work under pressure and meet deadlines and willingness to accept the assignment at short notice
<b>Technical Report Writer</b>		03 Months	<p><b>Qualification, knowledge &amp; expertise</b> The Technical Report Writer for the EGRA End-line Survey should have a Master’s or Ph.D. in Education, Social Sciences, or a related field, with at least 5–10 years of experience in educational research, literacy assessments, and technical reporting.</p> <p><b>Expertise</b> The candidate must have expertise in analyzing and interpreting quantitative and qualitative data, preferably using statistical software, and a strong understanding of EGRA methodology and early grade reading interventions.</p> <p><b>Skills</b> Proven skills in technical writing, policy analysis, and report development are essential, along with experience collaborating with education stakeholders, government agencies, and donor-funded projects. Strong attention to detail, ability to translate complex findings into clear, actionable recommendations, and knowledge of education policies and performance standards will be key for producing a high-quality end-line report.</p>
<b>Database administrator</b>	01	04 Months	<p><b>Knowledge and Experience:</b> At least a Bachelor’s degree (sixteen (16) years of education) in Information Technology, Computer Science, or a relevant subject from a foreign or local university duly recognized by the Higher Education Commission (HEC) of Pakistan</p> <p>Minimum 5 years of experience as a database administrator. Proven knowledge and skills of emerging trends in pedagogy and teacher training. Knowledge and experience in the public education sector in Pakistan are preferable.</p> <p><b>Skills:</b> Excellent skills in data formatting and administration. Excellent interpersonal and communication skills (oral and</p>

			<p>written). Professional-level fluency in English and Urdu.</p> <p><b>Abilities:</b> Ability to work under pressure and meet deadlines and willingness to accept the assignment at short notice</p>
<b>Data Analyst</b>	1	04 Months	<p><b>Qualification and Knowledge and Experience:</b> At least a Master's/BS degree (sixteen (16) years of education) in Education, Education, Languages or relevant social science, from a foreign or local university duly recognized by the Higher Education Commission (HEC) of Pakistan. Minimum 8 years of experience in data analysis of large-scale research studies. Minimum 5 years of experience in the field of analyzing complex data sets according to the needs of research questions. Minimum 3 years' experience in developing data cleaning, data analysis, and developing infographics and charts according to survey findings using advanced IT tools. Knowledge of data collection protocol, research design, data analysis, and reporting. Advanced skills in Stata, SPPSS, Excel and other IT tools used for large scale data analysis. Knowledge and experience in the public education sector in Pakistan is preferable.</p> <p><b>Skills:</b> Excellent skills and experience in data analysis and research base report. Excellent interpersonal and IT skills</p> <p><b>Abilities:</b> Ability to work under pressure and meet deadlines and willingness to accept the assignment at short notice</p>
<b>Master Trainers/ Quality Control Officers</b>	36	03 Months	<p><b>Qualification and Knowledge and Experience:</b> At least a Master's/BS degree (sixteen years of education) in Social Science, Education or Languages (Sindhi/Urdu) or relevant subject from a foreign or local university duly recognized by the Higher</p>

			<p>Education Commission (HEC) of Pakistan.</p> <p>Minimum 5 years of relevant experience in education particularly in student assessment and capacity building of data collection team, module development. Proven knowledge and skills of emerging trends in pedagogy and teacher training. Knowledge and experience in the public education sector in Pakistan is preferable.</p> <p><b>Skills:</b> Excellent skills and experience in conducting ToTs, writing manual, modules and training plans with a focus on purpose and audience. Excellent interpersonal and communication skills (oral and written) and Professional-level fluency in English Sindhi and Urdu.</p> <p><b>Abilities:</b> Ability to work under pressure and meet deadlines. Willingness to accept the assignment at short notice.</p>
<b>Total</b>			

### Non-Key Experts:

Position	No. of positions	Estimated Expert Person (Months)	Qualifications and Experience
Enumerators	72 Sindhi Language & 12 Urdu Language	Bachelors and higher degree. Though candidates with 12 years of education are also encouraged to apply if they have relevant experience and skill sets. Prior experience in data collection and surveys, preferably in the health or social sector with a minimum of 2 years of experience	Proven work experience as an Educational Survey Enumerator or similar role Able to walk long distances. Strict attention to detail to collect and record data as per shared protocols. Must be fluent in Urdu and Sindhi language

<p><b>Assistant Data Analyst</b></p>	<p>1</p>	<p>3 Months</p>	<p><b>Qualification and Knowledge and Experience:</b>  At least a Master's /BS degree (sixteen (16) years of education) in Education, Education, Languages or relevant social science, from a foreign or local university duly recognized by the Higher Education Commission (HEC) of Pakistan.  Minimum 4 years of experience in data analysis of large-scale research studies. Minimum 2 years of experience in the field of analyzing complex data sets according to the needs of research questions. Minimum 1 years' experience in developing data cleaning, data analysis, and developing infographics and charts according to survey findings using advanced IT tools.  Knowledge of data collection protocol, research design, data analysis, and reporting. Advanced skills in Stata, SPPSS, Excel and other IT tools used for large scale data analysis. Knowledge and experience in the public education sector in Pakistan is preferable.</p> <p><b>Skills:</b>  Excellent skills and experience in data analysis and research base report.  Excellent interpersonal and IT skills</p>
--------------------------------------	----------	-----------------	--

			<p><b>Abilities:</b> Ability to work under pressure and meet deadlines and willingness to accept the assignment at short notice</p>
Admin and Logistic Officers	2	4 Months	<p><b>Qualification and Knowledge and Experience:</b> At least a Bachelors degree (sixteen (16) years of education) in Business Administration, Public Administration, Commerce, or relevant discipline from a foreign or local university duly recognized by the Higher Education Commission (HEC) of Pakistan. Minimum 3 years of experience in the administration of large-scale research studies or any other team management for short-term assignments.</p> <p><b>Skills:</b> Excellent skills and experience in logistics/HR and other administrative work related to short-term projects Excellent interpersonal and communication skills (oral and written) and professional-level fluency in English and Urdu/ Sindhi</p>

### Selection Method

The Firm will be selected through consultant Qualification Selection (CQS) in accordance with the procedures set out in the World Bank Procurement Regulations for Borrowers, 2016 (revised March 2025, September 2023, August 2018 and November 2017).

SELECT project is going to be concluded in April 30 2026, if the project extends, the contract will also be extended.